

Phone: (676) 26 980/26 984 0800662 Corner of Lelue Road & Mateialona Road, Nuku'alofa Level 2, Retirement Fund Board Building

# THE OMBUDSMAN'S FINAL REPORT ON THE COMPLAINT BY SAIA HELU

**CASE NO. OMB 18/09** 

Whether or not the delays by Tonga Water Board and Revenue Department in processing Mr Saia Helu's tax refund claims for 2012/2013- 2013/2014 was reasonable?

26 June, 2018

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	3
Background	4
The Ombudsman's role	4
Complainant's Request for Form 4 & 9	4
Query of the Complainant's Tax Form 4	5
Reconciliation of Tax Forms and Refund Confirmed	7
Opinions	8
Recommendations	8
TWB Response to Provisional Report	9
Annex 1 – TWB Response 11 <sup>th</sup> June 2018	

#### **EXCECUTIVE SUMMARY**

- The complainant Mr Saia Helu (complainant) was formerly employed by Tonga Water Board (TWB) as Senior Meter Serviceman and was dismissed from service on 4<sup>th</sup> December 2013.
- 2. In October 2017, the complainant requested his Form 4 (Tax Witholding Certificate) for 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 from TWB for his tax refund claims. The complainant returned again to TWB on the same day requesting for his Form 9 (Refunds) which was also filled out and given to him by the TWB Accountant.
- 3. The complainant lodged both forms with the Ministry of Revenue and Customs (Revenue Department) in October 2017 to claim his tax refund for those years.
- 4. In January 2018, the Revenue Department advised the complainant that there was an issue with his refund application. The complainant returned to TWB to clarify the issue on his Form 4 and was not happy with the advice given to him. This became the basis of his complaint to my Office.
- 5. I have referred the complaint to both TWB and Revenue Department for responses which I have included and determined in this report.
- 6. This report outlines my findings on the relevant administrative conduct and decisions of both TWB and the Revenue Department in relation to this complaint.

So I am recommending two (2) things in this Report <u>pursuant to section 18(3)</u> of the Ombudsman Act 2001-

Firstly – that Tonga Water Board note their mistake in this complaint when failing to fill out the complainant's tax form accurately and should work to improve its services.

Secondly – that TWB report back to me within 3 months of the date this report to provide a follow up report on the recommendations.

#### BACKGROUND

- 7. The complaint was received on the 19 January 2018.
- 8. I assigned the investigation to my Investigation Team who undertook the investigation which involved meetings, telephone and email coversations with relevant officials from TWB and the Revenue Department.

#### THE OMBUDSMAN'S ROLE

- 9. Under section 11 of the *Ombudsman Act 2001*, the Ombudsman has the authority to investigate the administrative acts, decision, omissions and recommendations of an officer of an organization in his capacity as an officer of that organization. This applies to TWB which is an organization under the Act. (Section 18(1) and (2) of the *Ombudsman Act 2001*).
- 10. My investigation is not an appeal process. I would not generally substitute my judgment for that of the decision maker. Rather, I consider the substance of the act or decision and the procedure followed by TWB, and then form an opinion as to whether the act or the decision and the procedures followed by TWB was reasonable and properly followed.
- 11. My role is to consider the administrative conduct and decisions of TWB and to form an independent opinion on whether that conduct was fair and reasonable.

#### COMPLAINANT'S REQUEST OF TAX FORM 4 & 9

- 12. In or around October, the complainant visited TWB to request his Form 4 (tax withholding certificate, Income Tax Act 2007 for 2012/2013 -2013/2014. This was provided to him by Ms 'Anaseini Tautuiaki, the accountant.
- 13. Shortly after revoleving his Form 4, the complainant submitted it to the Revenue Department for his tax refund claim and was advised to go back to TWB on 7 March

2018<sup>1</sup> and get his From 9 (Tax Refunds, Income Tax Act 2007). The complainant obtained his Form 9 and submitted on the same day<sup>2</sup>.

## **OUERY OF THE COMPLAINANT'S TAX FORM 4**

- 14. In January 2018, an officer from the Revenue Department contacted the complainant with a query on his Form 4. Revenue Department advised him that the tax deducted column of his Form was blank for the concerned period therefore he needs to take his Form 4 back to TWB for review.
- 15. The complainant returned to TWB with his Form 4 and had it corrected by the Accountant, Ms 'Anaseini Tautuiaki. In addition, Revenue Department also called TWB about the complainant's Form 4. The revised Form 4 containing his calculated paye tax for the said period was then submitted to the Revenue Department.
- 16. TWB acknowledged their mistake to the Revenue Department in overlooking to fill out the tax deduction column on the complainant's Form 4. This became the basis of the reconciliation by Revenue Department of the complainant's Form 4 and Form 8 in order to confirm the actual refund amount.
- 17. A meeting was set up with the TWB Accountant and Head of Corporate Srvices on 22 March 2018<sup>3</sup>. In this meeting, the Accountant orally admitted that there was a query from Revenue Department on the complainant's Form 4. She states that the substance of the mistake was two fold:
  - a. There was misunderstanding between Revenue Department and TWB as to the filling of TWB's Form 7 (Monthly Paye Tax Form). Form 7 shows the total amount of gross income for all staff and sum of paye tax deducted from their gross income on each month. TWB filled this form manually and apparently Revenue Department only filled the first half wages of the complainant and failed to file the second half pay for that particular month. This means that only the paye tax amount for the first half wages of the complainant was recorded by Revenue Department and none for the second pay.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Makitalena Fifita, Acting CEO, MORC, Complaint by Mr Saia Helu – Case No. OMB 18/09 (ref:tsd011/2018) dated 7 March 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Saia Helu, Complait Form dated 19 January 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 'Elisiva Lui, *Meeting Notes* dated 22 March 2018 at TWB Board Room.

	·	v yktopologiczn¥diinkod zmierczeg				· 6	<u>-</u> (87)	
Name of amployee/payee (Surname first) Hingoa'o a Tokotahu "Sirra'u mui e vähenga' ('Uluaki tohi'i e	TIN Type o paymen F777 . Fa'ahing totangi k f£kahoko	f Date of payment ia Ahq	Pay period (weekly, fortnightly etc) Yaha'a tqimi vahe' (fakauike, fakauike	Y PAYE To Total salary and wages for period Lahi Fakalākujua ke Tukuhau'i	Total value of benefits for pay	Tax Deducted Tukuhau 'oku to'o' S	Net Amount Lahi 'oku toe S	
LANGLII	78544 V		117 117 1117 1217 25 4 1 10	281.eq	he vaha'a taimi vahe' S	7.88	074. 96 349. P7	
Marino 305	SLC1 V	. 3	117 112 17 117 12 17	71.30 3 . 11 3 . 11	-/5	. 8 <b>\$</b> 3	18. 27 36. 18 72. 11	t hop
Timete 800	428 /	le l		Silver market market	二 - 梅	EG 19	1.15 P	

Figure 14 shows the Form 7 manually recorded by TWB and submitted to Revenue Department.

b. The second fold is a mistake by TWB in filling out the period of employment column in the revised Form 4 for 2013-2014. TWB filled out by mistake the period to be from the 01 July 2013 - 30 June 2014<sup>5</sup> which should have been ended on 4 December 2014 as it was his last working day.

		The original given to the employee within 14 days of the and of the fiscal year. If an employee	
	ivaves your smotoyment during the fixed year, you should give either personally to the employee or by posting by prepaid letter of 5 years. An employee commensing simployment stall give th	this original gives to the employee within is days or the fined of the Item) some if we amplioused this original some second some some some some second some some some some some some some some	t
	PARATORANOA IL Ko e tahi Jakama ahi ka uni ke Jakafama a	The principal arrival? They because a see pear to broken "of the sear of to tell the total charles against "Freto "the	
1	ono v to the course black black of a la place on to entre between the second be set to the second be second be second be set to the second be s	i ha njemi koningi. U pa jatam ta sia jara Salanga "a i thinu mio tail" hi hi rahaisha ngatus. "I sia "i he ta Ian Taranisha hot sikholaha ngata maj ha ka jagawa tanga "i tololohaga "a a ta'u phapa tanga", pas "i tak "I tao "i het siku "a 7 hill "amis majala nat ha ngatus". Kungara ke sufa jabahangalosis "a taiti "ii "aatia paa jakastiapaa ki janagu ti sajala jahamismi tala". Kungara ke sufa jabahangalosis "a taiti "ii	ر
r	Employee's Tax Identification Number (filter tubuleau os taketaka ngana)	3>3>3>	-
-	Plant year' 1 July carre to 30 June 19 June		
	Ta'u fakapa'angar 1 Stutat	the state of the s	
_	Name of amotoyee  Hingos 'o a catolate nggie '.'	Sana E MELL	
_			•
	Tw'oslin'o e lokoleka ngede	from the state of	
**	Pata of birth.		
	and the second s		
٠,	Mame of employer  Mingoo 'o e lakatake 'a 'ano 'a e ngalus'anga	Tooks The same of	
_	Employer Tax Identification Flymber		
_	Pika sukuteus e tokotuka 'a 'ana, 'a e ngane'anga	10 50 10 50 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	
_	Employer's address Tu'esdia (o's Nasue longer')	1. P. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1.	
7	Period of 4   Actal cataly   Actal value   Total value   Employment   Autor cataly   Actal value   Employment   Autor cataly   Autor cataly   Employment   A	The Later Value I Total Value	
	Calulius / Callerent 2   Validia   pasistre	pe beneath property or detter or bearing armings	
	Polinication a Country 3 Columns	Total Waldeline Column	١.
•	Value of third is a second Fisher than make the	re e makullage e Wilmistoh Fishaddan imakullaga (Caluma Tukuhat ka manulla il mahullaga i Jacki laga e 'e hasee ('e	
:	Referent 1 Reference 2 realization by hi her works from the first open for the first open	of [ hakoton of ] by naft-'nnan ] Asha [ vad [ Notonuu	- 1
•	A Committee of the control of the co	School A State To September & State	
	"身本,我,你会们,上身对人。"	THE COLUMN	
•	- **   1	Seatime   Seatime	٠ [
•		A. T. B. C. W. M.	: ·
5	3/3 400 - 2 - 3 - 3 - 3 - 3 - 3 - 3	Maria San Company	7
	Transport Transport		

Figure 2 shows a copy of the complainant's Form 4 as initially filled by TWB showing the period of employment column 01/07/13 - 30/06/14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Copy of Form 7 received from TWB at Meeting dated 22 March 2018 at TWB Board Room. <sup>5</sup> Copy of Form 4 received from TWB AT Meeting dated 22 March 2018 at TWB Board Room.

- 19. TWB acknowledged its mistake in this complaint and committed to improving its services by computerizing its system to avoid further misunderstanding in the records and ensure that form filling is done accurately.
- 20. TWB confirmed that this issue was the first complaint of its kind and that no other employee had raised any issues with their tax refund.
- 21. In their response to the complaint received on 7 March 2018, the Revenue Department explained its process in relation to this filling of paye tax from TWB. TWB will submit the following Income Tax Forms
  - a. Form 4 every month, this form shows the gross income and paye tax deducted from an individual staff's income.
  - b. Form 7, is filed monthly, and it shows the gross income and amount of paye tax deducted for all of the staff employees (see Figure 1).
  - c. Form 8 would be a summary of the Form 7 which contains the amount of payee tax deducted from all staff employees in a year.
  - d. Form 9 is the tax refund form which is submitted to Revenue Department for refund claims.
- 22. Once all of these relevant Forms are filed in a fiscal year, Revenue Department will screen and review to ensure that it is correct before it is passed and filed away.

## RECONCILIATION OF TAX FORMS AND REFUND CONFIRMED

23. Upon receiving the complainant's revised Form 4, Revenue Department conducted a reconciliation of the TWB Form 8 for 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 (Annual Withholding Tax Statement, Income Tax Act 2007) with the complainant's Form 4 by abstracting his tax deductions to confirm whether he was owed a refund or not. This process involved retrieving the TWB file for the concerned fiscal years which had been passed and filed away to pull out the relevant forms (Form 4, Form 7 and Form 8) with the revised Form 4 and Form 9 submitted by the complainant. This comparison verified any inaccuracy between the two records kept by both TWB and the Revenue Department. The outcome of the comparison matched and thus the refunds was confirmed for approval.

24. When the reconciliation was complete it was found that the complainant's initial Form 4 which he submitted in October 2017 had been filled out incorrectly by TWB, however the revised Form 4 was correctly reconciled to the TWB's Form 8. The result was that the complainant was owed a tax refund of \$360.73 for the years 2012/2013 and 2013/2014. The complainant received his refund in March 2018.

#### **OPINIONS**

- 25. That Revenue Department is to be highly commended for the responsiveness to the complaint and for taking further steps to reconcile the inaccuracy in the complainant's Forms in order to facilitate his refund claim.
- 26. That having reviewed TWB's response I am satisfied that there was an adminitrative failure in the part of the Accountant when filling the complainant's Form 4 which was picked up by Revenue Department and referred back to the TWB.
- 27. That it appears the delays in processing the complainant's refund was partly the fault of the complainant. It is noted that the complainant had left TWB in 2013 and only went forward to claim his refund for the concerned period in 2017.
- 28. I further note that TWB initially denied receiving any query from the complainant and Revenue Department in relation to his Form 4 and later on admitted that they had during a meeting on 22 March 2018. I form the view that this is not a good reflection on TWB and that they should accept when there's flaw in their services and act to correct those mistakes as a way forward.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- 29. Firstly that TWB note their mistake in this complaint when failing to fill out the complainant's tax form accurately and should work to improve its services
  - Secondly that TWB report back to me within 3 months of the date this report is finalised to provide a follow up report on the recommendations.

# TWB'S RESPONSE to PROVISIONAL REPORT – 11<sup>th</sup> June 2018

**30**. On the 01<sup>st</sup> June 2018, I delivered my Provisional Report to TWB setting out my findings, opinions and recommendations. On the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2018, I received a letter of response letter from TWB and a copy is attached to this report as Annex 1 in pursuant with section 18(5) of the Ombudsman Act 2001.

'Aisea H. Taumoepeau, SC

Ombudsman



All correspondence to be addressed to:

The Chief Executive Officer Tonga Water Board PO Box 92 Nuku'alofa Kingdom of Tonga Telephone:

(676) 23 095 (676) 24 438

E-mail: Fax: Office Hours: (676) 24 438 stfinau@yahoo.com (676) 23 518

D

8:30 - 4:30pm

11th June 2018

Mr. 'Aisea Taumoepeau Ombudsman Ombudsman Office Nuku'alofa Tonga. Fright.

Dear Sir,

## Reply to Provisional Report under the Ombudsman's Act - Case No. OMB 18/09

Thank you for your letter on the 1st June 2018, regarding to the above stated matters.

Tonga Water Board have no further comment on the above stated matters and noted the recommendations provided by the Ombudsman.

Yours faithful A TONGA WATER BOARD -5

Mr. Sione T Finau
Chief Executive Officer
Tonga Water Board.
Nuku'alofa,